

Summary of the responses received an appraisal of views expressed

1. The points of view received as part of the consultation are set out in *italics* below and have been grouped according to the points raised where appropriate.
2. The Council's response to each point can be seen underneath, under the heading "*Appraisal of views expressed.*"
3. The following responses were received in favour of keeping Glan-yr-Afon Primary School open:

Local Ward Members response

4. Councillors Lee Bridgeman, Keith Jones and Heather Joyce submitted a joint response objecting to the proposal to close Glan-yr-Afon Primary School. The response included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 6)
 - *We ask that the Cabinet reject the proposal and come back with a comprehensive spelt out plan for how the provision of English medium primary school places in the Llanrumney area can be addressed for future years;*
 - *Glan-yr-Afon Primary School serves an area of high economic deprivation within Llanrumney; approximately half of the children are eligible for free school meals (46%) with many pupils identified as possessing additional learning needs. The school also has a 'Wellbeing Class' and 'Flying Start Provision'.*
 - *There has been a historic substantial lack of investment in the school building;*
 - *The school has had a torrid period with the long term suspension of its head teacher - there is no mention of these extraordinary circumstances in the consultation document;*
 - *The school has been served by a succession of interim headteachers which has dramatically undermined the running of the school;*
 - *The school has been handicapped by the suspension of its headteacher and a chronic historic lack of investment in its infrastructure;*
 - *Greatly increasing the majority percentage of non-baptised Catholic children within St Cadoc's RC Primary School seems a rather odd thing to do irrespective of how good the quality of education that is on offer;*
 - *The St Cadoc's RC Primary School site is accessed via Shaw Close, a road with serious speeding issues which would make a mockery of the council's avowed aim that children should seek to walk and cycle to school;*
 - *The council state that the condition of the physical infrastructure of Glan-yr-Afon necessitates the school's closure. It is rated on the A-D classification scale as being designated within Band C. Yet, only one other of the Llanrumney Primary Schools has a better rating for the state of the physical building;*

- *Llanrumney has had community assets taken away and these resources have not been replaced;*
- *Residents are not even guaranteed that places for their children will remain on the estate of Llanrumney.*

Appraisal of views expressed

5. The Council notes the views expressed by Local Ward Members.
6. It is acknowledged that the catchment of the school includes a Lower Super Output Area (LSOA) identified as one of the most deprived areas in Wales, within the first 5% in the 2014 Welsh Government Index of Multiple Deprivation for Wales. In 2016/17, 46% of learners were registered as entitle to free school meals, significantly above the national average of 18.9% and the Cardiff average of 22.3%.
7. Investment in school buildings is carried out in line with identified priorities including sufficiency and condition issues. As part of the Welsh Government 21st Century Schools Programme, the Council has invested in schools throughout the city. In these areas demand for places has been more than the number of places available. The proposal to close Glan yr Afon Primary School relates to the need to remove surplus places. There are a greater number of places in primary schools in the Llanrumney area than pupils who wish to attend these schools and whilst the number of children living in the area has increased there are still many more places than needed and the aim of the proposed change is to reduce the numbers of unfilled English-medium primary places.
8. There have been interim leadership arrangements at the school to cover the absence of the substantive Headteacher since March 2016. An experienced Headteacher has been seconded full time to the school with effect from September 2018.
9. The proposal to increase the number of places available at St Cadoc's Catholic Primary School is a separate proposal, and subject to consultation which is being carried out by the Governing Body of the school. In the event that the proposal to close Glan-yr-Afon Primary School is not progressed, the proposed change to the admission number at St Cadoc's Catholic Primary School would be withdrawn.
10. The Council had originally proposed to locate the new build Eastern High School on the Eastern Leisure Centre site within the Llanrumney ward, however, following prolonged public engagement with the local communities it was agreed that the new school be built on the former Cardiff and Vale College site on Trowbridge Road.
11. Additionally following public consultation it was agreed to maintain library provision in the area and the new Llanrumney Hub was established.
12. The Governing Body of St Cadoc's RC Primary School are consulting on a proposal to increase the admission number of the school across all age groups

to 60 utilising existing accommodation. Pupils from Glan-yr-Afon could move to St Cadoc's RC Primary School, other community primary schools in the immediate area or alternatively access places in schools within two miles of their home address if preferred. Additionally parents would have the option of transferring to Welsh-medium which the Council would support in line with the Welsh Government 1m Welsh speakers aspirations. It is however acknowledged that accessing school places outside of the local area may present challenges for some families.

Estyn

13. A response from Estyn included the following (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 6)
 - *The proposal is by Cardiff City Council. The proposal was submitted as a result of the fact that there are many more school places available in English-medium schools in the Llanrumney area than the number of pupils who wish to attend those schools. This has been consistent over a number of years. Cardiff City Council proposes to discontinue some of the surplus school places in schools in the Llanrumney area through closing Glan yr Afon Primary School from September 2019. As long as there are additional places available in other local schools, it is Estyn's view that closing Glan yr Afon Primary School would not have a detrimental effect on the standard of English-medium education in the Llanrumney area.*
14. The Council notes the views expressed.

Glan-yr-Afon Primary School Governing Body response

15. A response was received from the Chair of Governors on behalf of all the governors of the school. The responses raised the following points (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 6)
 - *Llanrumney is recognised as being in the 5% of the most deprived areas in Wales and its FSM is higher than any other school in the area;*
 - *Glan-yr-Afon Primary School services a particularly vulnerable population for whom Glan-yr-Afon is a vital community resource that goes beyond teaching;*
 - *It is not recognised that falling rolls have been adversely influenced by reputation in the local area damaged by the circumstances of the school over which it has no control;*
 - *The title of the Consultation Document is disingenuous. It is about the proposed closure of Glan-yr-Afon Primary School therefore it should say so;*
 - *People believe that this is not a consultation but a fait accompli with Glan-yr-Afon going to close and the school lost 25 pupils last week;*
 - *It is appalling that the condition and suitability of the school buildings can be used as a reason to close the school;*
 - *The numbers in St Cadoc's RC Primary School should be based on people of the Catholic faith not on the expectations that other pupils will be forced into faith school education;*

- *The financial situation of the school is not as a result of the failure of the school but of a damaged reputation. Because of the uncertainty of the situation a major restructure of staffing which would have dramatically readjusted the budget demands to deal with falling rolls has not taken place as being judged and advised that it would be inappropriate during this uncertain time of management.*
- *To suggest that children of all ages could walk up to two miles to school or be carried by car shows the lack of consideration of understanding of parents in a highly socially deprived area.*
- *Alternatives to these proposals should be explored e.g. phased review over 5 years; amalgamate with another local community school; reduce to one form entry school and federate with another school; reduce to one form entry and consolidate in the Foundation Phase part of the building and demolish the junior building or place a council facility such as The Court School on the site.*

16. The Governors response also included the following questions:

- *None of the schools in the area are full in every year group. If Bryn Hafod Primary School was closed Glan-yr-Afon and other schools could be filled. It is fatuous to argue for closure of Glan yr Afon because parents are sending their children to other schools in Reception when it is stated that the number of pupils on roll at Glan- yr-Afon has increased every year from 2013-17. How do you account for this?*
- *St Cadoc's RC Primary School is currently undersubscribed so why are they proposing to increase their places?*
- *Why were the governors not involved in a discussion about this proposal in order to contribute to the process and maybe avoid it by suggesting alternatives as we do so later in this response?*
- *Why were hard copies of either the main or summary documents not supplied to the governors, as they were to staff and parents?*
- *We understand that the dates of the consultation process were decided at a meeting of the parents and the LA with governors and staff not being consulted, why was this?*
- *The Government's "21st Century Schools" programme is spending millions of pounds on other schools, why not Glan-yr-Afon?*
- *If the demography of the area changes where will the pupils go if Glan- Yr-Afon Primary School closes?*
- *On Page 31 of the Consultation Document what the Local Authority has printed is very misleading. It is true that 'the school is facing a number of challenges'. However, it is definitely not true to print that 'these challenges are having an impact on the ability of the school to deliver a high standard of education'.*

Appraisal of views expressed

17. See paragraph 6.

18. The absence of the substantive Headteacher and the issues arising out of this were beyond the control of the Local Authority however it is acknowledged that this may have impacted on the decision of parents not to place children at the school.
19. As set out at the meeting with staff and governors, the public meeting and drop in sessions the proposal is at the consultation stage and no decision has been made to close the school. Any decision by parents to transfer children out of the school is a personal matter and does not indicate a decision on the part of the Council to close the school.
20. Information regarding the condition and suitability of school buildings is included in consultation documents as required by the Welsh Government's School Organisation Code.
21. There is no expectation that pupils will be forced into faith school education. See paragraphs 9 and 12.
22. A large proportion of the budget deficit relates to a reduction in formula funding arising out of the falling number of pupils on roll at the school. The budget has not been directly affected by the absence of the substantive Headteacher and employment of temporary Headteachers as this has been covered by Mutual Supply Funding throughout.
23. In line with Welsh Government guidance, children living over two miles from their primary school may be eligible for free home to school transport. Children living less than two miles from their primary school are not eligible for transport. It is however acknowledged that accessing provision which is further away may cause difficulties for some families particularly given the topography of the local area.
24. The alternative suggestions put forward by the Governing Body are noted. Consideration of these suggestions is subject to additional work being undertaken to establish the viability of any/all of these.
25. The number of pupils on roll on Glan yr Afon increased every year from 2013-17 however in the spring term 2018 there were only 151 pupils (Reception to Year 6) at the school resulting in 141 spare places at the school, almost half (48%) of the available places. The low number of pupils at Glan yr Afon Primary School resulted in the school setting a deficit budget of £130,000 for 2018/19.
26. See paragraph 9.
27. The proposal was brought forward in response to the need to address the issue of surplus places in the local area. The consultation has provided the opportunity for governors to be involved and to put forward alternative options for consideration.
28. Governors were provided with a link to the document however hard copies could have been made available if requested.

29. At a meeting with parents requested by the school following the July Cabinet meeting officers advised that the consultation would begin in September. This information was also shared with senior leaders at the school.
30. See paragraph 7.
31. Demand for English-medium community school places in each of the primary school catchment areas in Llanrumney varies.
32. Table 1 below shows the recent and future (projected) demand for places at entry to Reception year in the English-medium community primary school catchment areas in Llanrumney. These are the children resident in each catchment area, who may be attending any English-medium school.
33. This takes account of information provided by the NHS for children in the area who would attend school in future. It also considers how many attend an English-medium, Welsh-medium or faith school at present, and how many may wish to attend in future.

Table 1: Recent and projected demand for places at entry to Reception in English-medium community primary schools within each catchment area

Catchment area	Published Admission Number	PLASC (school census) data in January		Projection data			
		2015-2016	2016-2017	2017-2018	2018-2019	2019-2020	2020-2021
Bryn Hafod Primary School Catchment	60	51	42	36	44	34	35
Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School catchment	41	37	41	39	35	40	38
Pen-Y-Bryn Primary School catchment	30	15	27	23	25	27	28
Total within combined catchments	131	103	110	98	104	101	101

34. In total there are more school places available in Reception at Bryn Hafod, Glan-yr-Afon and Pen y Bryn Primary Schools than are needed for the future demand. Although there are 131 places available, the number of local pupils expected to take up places in future years does not exceed 104.
35. The most recent update from the NHS suggests that there will be fewer Reception-age pupils in the Llanrumney area in 2021-22 than in earlier years.
36. In the most recent Welsh Government School Categorisation at January 2018, the school was categorised as Amber (a school in need of improvement which needs help to identify the steps to improve or to make change happen more quickly). Teaching standards are improving, however the rate of change has not yet been significant enough to attain 'good' level across the school.

Interim Headteacher of Glan-Yr-Afon response

37. The interim Headteacher raised the following points (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 6) :
 - *The proposal to close Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School expects children to either attend a faith school or walk a significant distance, along busy roads and up significant inclines;*
 - *The proposal does not begin to show any understanding of the distance needed to be walked by children as young as 3 years, if they have to attend one of the other community schools in the area;*
 - *The school must not continue with the status quo established over the past 10 years, but that does not mean it needs to be closed and the families of lower Llanrumney left without a community school and with distinct barriers to accessing education;*
 - *Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School needs new, strong leadership, investment in the building, a significant review of staffing and structure, and a real belief and commitment to make it the outstanding school the children in Llanrumney need;*
 - *The initial Equality Impact Assessment fails to address the discrimination created by forcing families in Glan-yr-Afon catchment to have to attend a faith school - St Cadoc's RC Primary School;*
 - *There are not enough spaces for all children in all year groups at Bryn Hafod and Pen-y-bryn Primary Schools for families wishing to choose a community school;*
 - *The consultation shows it is wholly reliant on St Cadoc's Catholic Primary School extending its admission numbers. This proves that whilst there are surplus places, there are not enough places for all children. The summary*

document shows this clearly: "In 2017-18 there were 113 pupils enrolled in the Reception – Year 4 classes at Glan-yr-Afon Primary School. If the school closed and St Cadoc's Catholic Primary School also increased their places, there would be 156 places available in the schools in Llanrumney";

- *The geography/topography of Llanrumney means accessing another community school (non-faith) will be very, very difficult for many families;*
- *The discrimination against many of the poorest families in Cardiff – making education so inaccessible to many. The proposal suggests putting barriers in the way of pupil-progress and is in direct conflict with the Closing the Gap priority the LA and Welsh Government has;*
- *Maintaining good attendance at school will be very difficult for many children from the lower end of Llanrumney;*
- *The discrimination against non-Catholic families – who will have no choice but to choose a faith school due to the practicalities of physical access and space, not because it is what they want for their children;*
- *Glan-yr-Afon has the highest FSM percentage and ALN percentage in Llanrumney. There is extensive evidence that the biggest group advantaged by smaller schools are children in areas of deprivation and disadvantage;*
- *The rising numbers of families returning to choosing English medium community schools in Llanrumney has been evidenced this year, with an over-subscribed Eastern High School. In the past decade, one of the reasons parents have selected Welsh-medium primary schools and faith schools is that the former Llanrumney and Rumney High Schools both provided a poor quality of education, and they wanted to maximise their chances of accessing a better secondary education;*
- *It is highly unjust that the faith schools in the area cannot be considered in this. St Mellon's CW Primary School has a poor building, a tiny admission number and is therefore a huge financial burden on the LA. Why does it not merge with St Cadoc's and become an ecumenical school?*

Appraisal of views expressed

38. See paragraph 12.
39. See paragraphs 9 and 12.
40. If Glan yr Afon Primary school were to close, Admissions Officers would work with parents to provide details on available places and information on school so that families could make a well informed decision about their child's transfer. In the event of there being more demand for community places than places available in Llanrumney either because the proposal to increase the admission number at St Cadoc's did not go ahead or parents did not wish to access

catholic provision, it may be necessary for children to transfer to schools outside of the Llanrumney area.

41. It is acknowledged that the geography/topography of the Llanrumney area may cause difficulties for some families.
42. The concern regarding the maintenance of good attendance is acknowledged. All schools have processes in place to maintain/improve attendance and work with the families of any/all children whose attendance is a cause for concern.
43. The potential for an increasing number of families to opt for English-medium primary school provision given the improving profile of Eastern High School is acknowledged. Admissions to community high schools are based on residence within catchment and attendance at a faith or Welsh-medium primary school would not prejudice any application for a place at Eastern High.
44. The reorganisation of faith schools serving the area is a matter for the Church in Wales Diocese and the Catholic Arch Diocese.

Staff of Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School

45. A joint response was received from the staff of Glan-yr-Afon Primary School. It included the following points (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 6):
 - *The performance and prospects for improvement of Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School have not been explained accurately or acknowledged within the Consultation Document;*
 - *The suspension in March 2016 of the Headteacher and the subsequent court case has had a damaging effect on the whole school- staff and pupils alike;*
 - *At times the acting head, the deputy head, the ALNCO, site superintendent, all admin staff and several teachers were absent on sick leave directly or indirectly due to the stress of the situation;*
 - *There was little support at that time when the school could have avoided Estyn monitoring;*
 - *In 2017/18 our progress data showed that our pupils had made excellent progress. This data was not included in the consultation document but we feel that if this was compared with other schools locally it would give a truer picture of achievement;*
 - *The best interests of the child must be a top priority in all decisions and actions that affect children;*
 - *Has the local authority considered the Well-being of Future Generations Act (Wales 2015) as there is no reference to it in the consultation documents;*
 - *Glan-yr-Afon Primary School had a balanced budget when the headteacher was suspended. The deficit has dramatically increased in the last two years;*
 - *Why was the governing body allowed to set a deficit budget in 2017/18 and why have they set a deficit budget of such a large sum for 2018/19 on the recommendation of the local authority?*

- *Glan-yr-Afon used to be three separate schools, which have been amalgamated about twenty years ago. This in itself has led to there being excess classrooms;*
- *Some parents in recent years opted to send their children to faith provision due to the bad reputation of the former Llanrumney High School. The new school Eastern High is now an over-subscribed school, which may well lead to an increase in demand for a non-faith, English medium primary school in the bottom end of Llanrumney;*
- *Following his conviction Kevin Thomas is still in post, still being paid- this money should be used to improve our school;*
- *Local councillor and an employee from the local authority both advised parents to move their children to other schools during the consultation;*
- *There are many new homes planned in Llanrumney and Rumney. With so much building going on in the local area this is not the right time to be considering closing a school;*
- *We would like to question what support Glan-yr-Afon Primary School has received (as mentioned on page 17 of the Consultation Document);*
- *Why was the Glan-yr-Afon Primary School building not considered for 21st Century Schools funding?*

Appraisal of views expressed

46. The consultation document reflects the judgements made by the Central South Consortium and Estyn.
47. See paragraph 18.
48. Cardiff Council has to consider the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 and how this strategy may improve the social, economic, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales. The proposal to close Glan-yr-Afon relates to the need to remove surplus places in the Llanrumney area and would allow for funding currently being used to maintain these places being used to support teaching and learning.
49. See paragraph 22.
50. Part of the surplus accommodation at the school has been used to accommodate Flying Start Provision. The remaining surplus arises out of the low number of children attending the school.
51. See paragraph 43.
52. Matters related to the absence of the substantive Headteacher have been/continue to be subject to legal and HR processes.
53. See paragraph 19.
54. As set out in the consultation document, several new housing development are being built in Llanrumney through the Cardiff Housing Partnership Programme. The number of pupils from these developments is not expected to have a

significant impact on the number of pupils needing places at primary schools in Llanrumney with the total increase in pupils from the known housing developments being fewer than four in each year group.

55. The school is 'Amber' in the national categorisation model however the level of support provided to Glan yr Afon Primary School by the Education Consortium, the Council and by other schools has been greater than would normally have been given to a school in this category.
56. The school will continue to be categorised as Amber this year and will continue to be given extensive external support in order to improve.
57. See paragraph 7.

Flying Start Provision at Glan yr Afon Primary School

58. Flying Start Health Visitors based at Glan yr Afon Primary School collectively responded to the consultation. Their response included the following points: (a copy of the full response can be seen at Appendix 6)
 - *As Flying Start Health Visitors we make a huge contribution to positively changing the lives of children and their families within the Llanrumney area. Based on site at Glan yr Afon Primary School we have high visibility with parents and children attending the school;*
 - *Our engagement with local families and the wider multi-disciplinary agencies is crucial to safeguarding children in the local area. Being based at Glan yr Afon Primary School has enabled us to identify and work closely with families attending the school;*
 - *In order for our support to continue, it is vital that we have a profile and remain locally in order to continue to deliver a robust Flying Start programme.*
59. The Council notes the views expressed. If Glan yr Afon Primary School closed the Council would make arrangements to move the Flying Start provision and it would stay in the local area.

Consultation with the pupils of Glan yr Afon Primary School

60. Cardiff Research Centre (CRC) were commissioned by the School Organisation, Access and Planning team to undertake engagement with pupils of Glan yr Afon. CRC designed and facilitated classroom based activities with pupils at the school. Twenty-one pupils took part in the engagement exercise ranging from year 2 to year 6. (A full copy of the methodology can be seen at Appendix 5)
61. *The number one concern for the pupils taking part in the engagement exercise focused on changing teachers. Pupils were worried not only from the perspective of fitting into a new classroom but were also thinking about what would happen to their existing teachers should Glan yr Afon close.*

62. *Whilst bullying was not raised initially as a particular concern it was scored highly as part of this follow on exercise. Similarly, making new friends, getting to know a new building and uncertainty around what will eventually happen, were all also recorded as a cause for concern by a large number of pupils.*
63. *Some pupils commented that they didn't want to have to go to St Cadoc's RC Primary School should the proposed closure go ahead as they weren't Catholics, and so wouldn't fit in.*
64. *Pupils also verbally expressed concern about what would happen to forest school. This was clearly an aspect of the school that the children enjoyed and gained a lot from. Pupils were concerned that this facility may not be available to them at a new school. They were also mindful as to what would happen to the trees, animals etc. of this space if there were to be future developments on the current school site.*
65. *The role of selecting primary schools to determine which secondary school pupils would ultimately attend was also raised with some pupils concerned that their future choices could be affected.*
66. *Pupils felt that an opportunity to visit any new school, to meet teachers, pupils and get some familiarity with a new setting could help to allay concerns that they may have.*
67. *The current 'not knowing' was a source of significant concern. Pupils asked to be 'just told straight' what was happening so that they could try to get used to the idea.*
68. *Pupils were keen to have information provided to them via an official channel, with a visit from a council officer to provide direct updates the preferred choice. It was clear that information is currently coming to pupils from a variety of sources including the school, parents and the playground. Pupils wanted to feel informed and be updated directly regarding any developments.*
69. *Knowledge that they would be transferring with classmates and siblings would also reduce concerns significantly.*
70. *In addition to these comments pupils currently in Y5 who attended the public meeting and who submitted individual responses expressed concerns about having to transfer schools twice within a short space of time, once for Y6 and secondly for Y7.*

Appraisal of views expressed

71. A school closure places school staff at a potential risk of redundancy and this will need to be managed in line with the School Redeployment and Redundancy Policy which has been adopted by the Governing Body.
72. The concerns regarding bullying, transferring to a new building and the uncertainty around what will happen are acknowledged. All primary schools in

Cardiff are able to meet the needs of pupils and Council Officer would work with the school and parent to move children to alternative schools in the event of the school closing.

73. There would be no requirement for children to transfer to St Cadoc's RC Primary School.
74. Should there be a decision to dispose of all or part of the Glan yr Afon Primary School site it would be necessary to consider the future use of the site including the forest school area.
75. Admissions to community high schools are based on residence within catchment and attendance at a faith or Welsh-medium primary school would not prejudice any application for a place at Eastern High.
76. The wish for pupils to be updated directly is noted.
77. It is not possible to guarantee that classmates and siblings could transfer to another school together in the event of Glan yr Afon Primary School closing.
78. The concerns expressed by Y5 pupils are noted.

Other responses received

Lack of appropriate support from the Local Education Authority

79. Glan yr Afon Primary School has faced a number of challenges following the absence of the substantive Headteacher. Responses included the following points.
80. *Having to survive and carry on during this time was very difficult for staff, parents and pupils' alike, as none or very little help was given by the Local Authority. On numerous occasions, the school asked for help to run/manage the school, but no help was forthcoming.*
81. *For 1 whole term, two members of the senior leadership ran the school, in the absence of the Head and Deputy, who was on the sick with stress.*
82. *The Local Authority's decision to appoint an inexperienced Deputy Head as Headteacher of Glan-Yr-Afon Primary School was detrimental to the school, but no one has ever been held to account.*
83. *The focus on the budget deficit of £130,000 does not take into consideration the savings that the school has already made towards removing that deficit, nor does it take into consideration the fact that until our substantive head was suspended our budget had not had this level of deficit.*

Appraisal of views expressed

84. See paragraphs 8, 55 and 56.

85. See paragraph 22.

Quality and Standards

86. *The proposal fails to mention that the schools prospect for improvement was Good when the Inspection was undertaken in 2015. This was a more positive judgement than that received for Pen y Bryn . It suggests that the school has needed more support than any other Amber schools in the area but fails to mention the absence of a consistent and substantive head for the last 2 and a half years and the fact that the school has had a turbulent time of management during this period.*
87. *Since the Estyn inspection in 2015, the standards of teaching and learning at Glan yr Afon Primary School have been never been in doubt or even questioned.*
88. *Glan yr Afon Primary School was in the strongest position for improvement. It would have been very hard if not impossible for our school to improve considering the number of headteachers and changes of governing body we have had during the last three years.*
89. *Last year our pupils made excellent progress. All our Foundation children made expected progress and most better than expected progress. All our Key Stage 2 pupils (except 1) made expected progress and many made better than expected progress. This data has not been included in the consultation report- I believe this would compare very favourably with other schools!*
90. *Teaching and learning has never been an issue at Glan yr Afon. All staff regularly exceed their Performance Management targets and no staff member has ever been involved in the capability process.*
91. *The Consultation Document states that the school had made sufficient progress in all areas but fails to mention that in 3 areas the progress was rated as strong. The report does not show how the school is positively moving forward and providing strong learning opportunities for the pupils.*
92. *The number of inaccuracies and misleading statements that the '21st Century Schools Consultation Document 2018' contains are many and the current position of Glan yr Afon, with regards to its standards of Teaching have been totally misrepresented.*
93. *The school could now be in a position with the legal proceedings concluded to move forward but the opportunity is being denied to show what Glan yr Afon Primary School could be like with a full time head and proactive management.*
94. See paragraphs 46, 55 and 56.

Loss of friendship groups and being parted from siblings

95. *Many children are already displaying signs of heightened anxiety at the prospect of school closure, worrying about being split from their siblings, friends and the safety of familiar buildings.*

Appraisal of views expressed

96. It is acknowledged that the proposal to close the school impacts on those children at the school. All primary schools in Cardiff are able to meet the needs of pupils. In the event of the school closing, Council Officers would work with the school and parents to move children to alternative schools.

Cardiff Council has taken so much from the Llanrumney community

97. *We as a community have lost so much from the bottom end of Llanrumney. We have lost the Community Centre (Barn), Llanrumney High School and now Glan yr Afon Primary School as the only non Faith or Welsh school*
98. *Generations of local families have attended Glan yr Afon Primary School.*
99. *If you close the school there will be no community left because Glan yr Afon Primary School is where local families meet up and socialise.*
100. *Glan yr Afon Primary School is the only community facility left in Llanrumney. It can be the heart of lower Llanrumney, a much needed resource.*

Appraisal of views expressed

101. See paragraphs 10 and 11.

Home to school proximity and transport costs

The views expressed included the following:

102. *The Consultation Document suggests that children may have to travel further to school. It does not take into consideration the Cardiff Walk to School initiative if it is actively promoting the need to be driven to school and will have a detrimental effect on safer routes to school and on parking.*
103. *I'm concerned that my four children might not be able to attend the same school. I don't drive and can't afford bus fare everyday. Will I get help with this?*

Appraisal of views expressed

104. See paragraphs 12 and 23.

Well-being class at Glan yr Afon

105. *The city may be looking to establish further classes in other schools but this is not an easy prospect. There has been a limited number of schools who have shown a willingness to develop these classes on their sites. Where is it proposed that these children should be accommodated?*

106. *Many parents from Llanrumney and across the city have valued the school's inclusive input and our class for how it has given transformational help to children with significant social, emotional and behavioural needs. In recent years when county provision has been insufficient to meet growing needs Glan yr Afon has made a major long term contribution.*

Appraisal of views expressed

107. There are currently five Wellbeing classes across the city. The Council is also planning to open more classes in other schools.
108. If the school closes, the Council would be able to close the Wellbeing class with no impact on pupils.

Closing the school will have a detrimental effect on the educational attainment and well-being of pupils

109. *A single mother with 2-4 children and no car will not be able to get her children all the way to Pen Y Bryn Primary School in bad weather. Also if one child is ill, all will likely remain at home due to difficulties in managing the longer distance to and from school.*
110. *The "closing the gap" aims for the Council and Government are seriously negated by this proposal. Children have a right to attend primary school- this should be a local school which is part of their community.*

Appraisal of views expressed

111. It is acknowledged that the closure of the school may result in difficulties for some families.
112. The Council works closely with the governing bodies of schools to ensure that standards in schools are high, that teaching is good and that leadership and governance is strong.
113. The Council does not expect this proposal to have any negative impact on the quality and standards of education or the delivery of the Foundation Phase and Key Stage 2.
114. Other schools in the local area have been judged by Estyn to have standards that are as good or better than Glan yr Afon Primary School.

Families with English as an additional language (EAL)

115. Several families with English as an additional language who have settled in the local area responded to the consultation to explain that they currently receive support from Glan yr Afon Primary School in terms of staff reading letters for them and taking time to explain things.

116. The close proximity of Glan yr Afon to their home address has made this support very accessible for them, and they are concerned that they may lose this support and feel cut off from the local community if the school closes and they have to attend school further away.
117. The views expressed included the following:
118. *My family and I are Refugees so value the security and stability that we currently experience at Glan yr Afon. I am concerned that my children may not settle if they have to change schools.*
119. *It would not be possible for my wife or I to take our children to more than one school as we do not drive and have no spare money for transport costs.*

Appraisal of views expressed

120. The views expressed are noted.
121. Pupils with English as an Additional Language can be supported in any school in Cardiff.
122. There is no information available that suggests that the proposal would have a negative effect on how children with English as an additional language are supported. All schools in Cardiff would continue to provide support that is appropriate to the individual needs of each pupil.

Do not want to choose a faith school

123. Responses were received raising concerns that the alternative school mentioned in the consultation document (St Cadoc's Catholic Primary School) is a faith school and not a community school. The views expressed included the following:
124. *Promoting St Cadoc's RC Primary School to the parents of Glan yr Afon Primary School as an alternative is removing the parents right to decide if they want their children raised in a faith school and their choice of religion or not. This is in direct contravention of the UNCRC convention 14 allowing children to express and follow their own choice of religion.*
125. *There does not appear to have been any consideration that parents may not wish their child/children to have a Catholic Education.*
126. *The numbers in St Cadoc's Catholic Primary School should be based on people of the Catholic faith not on the expectations that other pupils will be forced into faith school education.*
127. *St Cadoc's is a Voluntary Aided school and their numbers should not be arbitrarily decided by their governors but by the Council School Organisation plan. No other school can determine their own intake apart from other faith*

schools. The school is undersubscribed now. Why are they proposing to increase their places?

Appraisal of views expressed

128. The views expressed are noted and the Council acknowledges that not all families will chose faith provision.
129. See paragraph 12.

St Cadocs RC Primary School will be overcrowded

130. *My grandchildren attend St Cadoc's RC Primary School and I feel it will be overcrowded with Glan yr Afon children. The proposal is not fair on both schools.*
131. *Would there be more teachers or assistants to help with larger classes?*

Appraisal of views expressed

132. Changing the use of existing rooms at St Cadoc's Primary School would allow for additional children to be admitted to the school and would not result in overcrowding.
133. The staffing structure and allocation of classes is a matter for the governing body of the school.

Safety needs to be considered if St Cadocs R C Primary School takes on more pupils

134. *More cars outside St Cadoc's RC Primary School is not feasible. Parking needs to be provided for children's safety.*
135. *St Cadoc's RC Primary School site is accessed via Shaw Close, a road with serious speeding issues which would make a mockery of the council's avowed aim that children should seek to walk and cycle to school.*

Appraisal of views expressed

136. Around 30% of car journeys made during the morning rush hour are trips to schools or colleges. Travel to school by car can add to traffic on main roads and lead to congestion and problems with parking on residential streets near to schools.
137. St Cadocs' RC Primary School is currently part of the Sustrans Active School Programme which encourages children to walk, scooter and cycle to school.
138. The school is aware that there are already problems with traffic and parking around St Cadoc's school in the mornings and evenings. It is also aware that

speeding traffic along Ball Road is a problem. It has been liaising with the Council on improving this.

The Glan yr Afon site

139. *What is going to happen to the Glan yr Afon site? If it is houses, it means more children with no school places.*
140. Should there be a decision to close the school and to dispose of all or part of the school site it would be necessary to consider the future use of the site. Any funds that the school receives for the site would be expected to be used for funding for the School Organisation Plan Programme, minus any costs for demolition, security etc.

Those with mobility issues and health conditions will suffer having to travel to a school further away

141. *I am a disabled woman who looks after my grandson. Some days when I am really not well I will ring the school and the teacher will walk him out for me or I can ring another one of the parents and they will walk him down.*
142. *My children suffer with asthma, which is made worse by travelling longer distances and is affected by colder weather.*

Appraisal of views expressed

143. It is acknowledged that the closure of the school may result in difficulties for some families.

Conservation

144. *The grounds of Glan yr Afon are hugely valuable for learning opportunities such as Forest School and these are invaluable for the children of Glan yr Afon.*
145. *I am concerned about the natural habitat of the foxes, squirrels and bats that are living around the school. There are bats on the roof – I have seen them flying around for years as I live next door to the school and was born here.*

Appraisal of views expressed

146. See paragraph 140.

Planned new housing in Llanrumney

147. *Housing developments- the majority of houses being 2 or 3 bedroom then that would surely increase more than 1 pupil per year group as is suggested. The old Llanrumney High school site has also been earmarked for Phase 2 building in order to meet the requirements of a 10,000 housing list. When this is undertaken in the near future there will be the need for further school places.*

Appraisal of view expressed

148. See paragraph 54.

Alternative Options

149. A number of alternatives to the proposed closure of Glan yr Afon Primary School have been suggested during the public consultation. These are listed below:

- *Reduce the admission number to 1-form entry and federate the school with another primary school to improve teaching and leadership and assist in the financial sustainability of both schools;*
- *Reduce the size of the school building by locating the whole school in the Infant /Flying Start part of the building making it more efficient.*
- *Invest in the Glan yr Afon site buildings and change the name of the school, as some within the community see it as having a negative reputation and to bring it up to 21st Century standards.*
- *Amalgamate Pen-y Bryn Primary School on the bigger Glan yr Afon site and changing the catchment area of Llanrumney to suit this amalgamation and pupil distribution. Access to Glan yr Afon could easily be improved by a one-way system and separate exit/entry for traffic, using other streets which also back onto the grounds of the school. The sale of the Pen y Bryn site would be more profitable than selling the Glan yr Afon site, and the profits from this could be used towards modernising and remodelling (or rebuilding) Glan yr Afon.*
- *Create mixed age classes to save money such as putting nursery and reception pupils together;*
- *Phased review over 5 years to enable pupils to complete their education at Glan yr Afon Primary School.*

Appraisal of views expressed

150. The alternative suggestions put forward are noted. Consideration of these suggestions is subject to additional work being undertaken to establish the viability of any/all of these.

Views of those in support of the proposal

151. Of the 9 responses received in favour of the proposal, one parent expressed concerns about child safety at the school. Two responses supported the proposed closure of Glan-yr-Afon Primary School, but only if certain concerns can be addressed.

152. The 9 responses included the following points:

- *There are too many schools in the Llanrumney area. Whilst the Council has provided different types of schools .i.e Faith and Welsh-medium they have not considered the financial cost to the rate payer many of whom do not have children attending school. If the closure is done in a way that does not impact on the children then all should be ok.*
- *When all the housing developments in the area are complete we may not have enough spaces in not just primary but also the secondary schools in the area. I believe a better solution would be to temporarily rehouse the pupils in other schools then demolish and rebuild a new school on the Glan-yr-Afon site which can then can house the pupils from Glan-yr-Afon and Bryn Hafod amalgamating the two schools thus saving money on two heads, cleaners, caretakers cooks etc.*
- *There is an assumption that additional places will be made available at St Cadoc's. The statement that if the Admission Number at St Cadoc's is not increased, the Council could consult at a later date on other changes, is quite remarkable, given that the proposed closure date for Glan-yr Afon is 31/8/19. There will be no time for an alternative plan.*
- *St Cadoc's is the only community school within reasonable walking distance for children from the bottom end of Burnham Avenue. This is, however, a faith school which presumably parents would have already chosen if they so wished. The only feasible alternative non-faith community school with capacity appears to be Bryn Hafod, which is a considerable walk for parents/children along Ball Road.*
- *The old Llanrumney High School site is at the pre-planning consultation stage for 98 dwellings of which no mention is made in the Consultation. Where will these children go?*
- *The Consultation Document states that the Council would consult at a later date on changes to catchment areas. If no changes are made, would there not be 146 children from Glan-yr-Afon in 2019/20 who would need to transfer to other schools?*
- *I understand that Trowbridge Primary/Greenway Primary are to become federated with one Head. Has this model been considered for Glan-yr-Afon and either Bryn Hafod or Pen-yr-Bryn as a cost saving measure?*

Appraisal of views expressed

153. The views expressed are noted.